Master-Seminar Summer Semester 2022

Medical High Skilled Migrants in Germany

Lecturer:
Prof. Dr. Dilek Zamantılı Nayır, Türkisch-Deutsche Universität (Turkish-German University) Istanbul

How to apply:

- Name of seminar: Aktuelle Fragen der Personal- und Organisationsökonomik
- Application deadline: January 16th 2022
- The application process runs via https://flip.wiwi.uni-wuerzburg.de/. Please upload a current transcript of record and an overview of all exams you will be taking this semester.

Time Schedule:

- February 14th, 2022 – Students receive papers to be presented (one paper per student)
- Monday, March 14th, 2022 (online) 10:00-12:00 – 14:00-16:00
  - Kick-off meeting – Introduction and Presentation of the seminar by lecturer (Theory/Research Outline) 10:00-11:00
  - Student presentations (10 minutes) and topic assignment – 11:00-12:30 (incl. Q&A)
    - “What do you think could be added further to this paper – further research suggestions???”
  - Students develop questions for a qualitative interview guide until 18 hrs (same day) and send it to lecturer
  - Lecturer sends final version interview guide until 22 hrs. same day
- Mid March – End April 2022:
  Empirical field study
  - Interview of three Turkish doctors practicing in Germany for more than five years (interview in German)
  Interviews to be finished by end April (Zoom allowed – however recorded!)
  Paper to be written by students
- Friday, May 13th, 2022:
  Hand in interviews (transcribed and translated to English)
  Hand in final version of your seminar paper (15 pages – Times New Roman – 12 font – Interview summary + Responses to research questions)
- Wednesday May 20th, 2022: Presentations research findings (presence)
The number of participants is limited to 12 students.

The total grade of the seminar comprises a mark for the seminar paper and a mark for the block seminar (presentation of your paper, presented comments to another paper, and discussion).

The seminar will be held in English.

Outline:

In this Master seminar, we will look at a sample of Turkish doctors who relocated to Germany for professional reasons in order to fill many gaps in the literature and expand our understanding of a specific group of high-skilled migrants (HSM). In the course, we will apply “Research-Based Learning” (RBL). Students prepare themselves for the research project through reading academic papers, identify gaps in the literature and are then involved in the research process to address the gaps identified. Highly skilled migrants are becoming increasingly crucial in industrialized countries’ labor markets. Meanwhile, research shows that HSMs from poor nations are frequently hired in professions that do not match their degree or experience levels, resulting in a "waste of talent".

Our first goal in this course is to dive more into Turkish doctors’ career attempts in Germany.

Another research subject we want to examine within the course is how Turkish doctors adjust to Germany’s social and professional environment. Migrants frequently employ a variety of cultural, social, and economic capital gathered in their home country to migrate to the host country, such as personal contacts that aid the relocation. Furthermore, migrants mix multiple visas to extend their stays in the host country or to move to a host country for studies and then opt to stay. But how do Turkish doctors adjust when they find out about the (non-)usefulness of cultural and social capital in the new work context as well as about acquiring new forms of capital and mixing a set of new ones?

A third literature gap we want to address in this course are return decisions of Turkish doctors. We want to find out, whether there is such an intention, and what are the conditions this particular group of HSM sees as necessary to repatriate.

The information gathered on Turkish doctors in Germany by the seminar participants will be complemented by information gathered in Turkey on doctors potentially interested in migrating to Germany and doctors who returned to Turkey from Germany. These interviews will be conducted by students at the Turkish German University in Istanbul during the same period of time and shared with the seminar participants.

Our key research questions are as follows:

(1) How do cultural and ethno-national identity shape the mobility experiences of Turkish doctors?
(2) What is the role of the family and gender differentials in their migration?
(3) How do the perceptions of native and foreign social/cultural capital shape their professional journey?
(4) How do Turkish doctors at various stages in their lives perceive their journey? Do they have return intentions – why yes and why no?

(5) Which expectations/hopes do not-yet-migrated Turkish doctors have about a potential life in Germany?

List of Readings – each participant starts with one of these papers as basis for the seminar paper

1. “Us versus them”: Sensemaking and identity processes in skilled migrants’ experiences of occupational downgrading
D. Fernando and G. Patriotta
Journal of World Business 55 (2020) 101109

We examine how a group of highly-skilled migrants from Sri Lanka made sense of occupational downgrading associated with their career transition to the UK. Our findings highlight three distinct sensemaking narratives that enabled the migrant employees to develop a more positive identity in the face of occupational downgrading. While all the narratives followed a similar cognitive pattern, one that represented the occupational world in terms of a cultural opposition between ‘us’ and ‘them’, the choice of a particular sensemaking narrative was shaped by the organisational context in which the migrant employees were embedded. In particular, the migrant workers’ emotional experiences within their new organisation influenced the way in which they discursively framed the ‘us versus them’ relationship. We contribute to the international migration literature by theorizing how sensemaking links identity to migrants’ occupational experiences in new organisational contexts.

2. Attracting High Skilled Individuals in the EU: The Finnish Experience
Andrej Přívara, Eva Rievajová, Adina Barbulescu

The ageing population, demographic change and a lack of skilled labour in the EU are increasingly provoking governments to apply direct measures to aggressively recruit economic migrants, particularly high skilled individuals (HSIs). As most countries in the EU face similar challenges, attracting HSIs from the third countries are predominantly vital. One of the EU-wide programs to attract skilled professionals is the Blue Card program, which was introduced in 2009 as part of the European Council Directive to focus on highly qualified employment, aimed at making Europe an appropriate host region for qualified workers from the non-EU countries. The EU Blue Card programme is adopted by 25 EU member states, apart from Ireland, Denmark and the United Kingdom. In this article, we discussed underlying features of the EU Blue Card program with a particular focus on the Finnish experience as one of the most successful the EU countries in attracting and retaining talent and HSIs.

3. Skilled Migrants and Negotiations: New Identities, Belonging, Home and Settlement

Issues of identity, home and belonging underline most transnational and transmigrational experiences. Globally, there is increasing interest in issues related to the settlement of migrants; yet there is growing evidence on a quotidian basis that migrant settlement into a host country is not a smooth experience. Drawing on qualitative empirical work, involving a large cross section of ethnically diverse skilled migrants located in a regional Australian centre, this article explores the issue of settlement through considering how the concepts of identity, belonging, settlement and home are presented in narrative accounts from skilled migrants to Australia. Intersectional theoretical frameworks are used to explore migrants’ perceptions of identity, belonging and home in negotiating and realising their new settlement. This also helps highlight the differences in skilled and non-skilled experiences using visa status, gender, education, ethnicity and socio-economic status/class to conduct an intersectional analysis.
4 Migration and Lived Experiences of Racism: The Case of High-Skilled Migrants in Wrocław, Poland

Krzysztof Jaskulowski - Marek Pawlak
International Migration Review 2020, Vol. 54(2) 447-470.

This article examines migrants' lived experiences with racism in Wrocław, Poland. Drawing on qualitative research conducted among high-skilled migrants, it analyzes various ways migrants encounter, understand, and cope with racism. Our case study broadens discussion about migration and racism by analyzing an Eastern European, post-socialist, predominantly “white” receiving society seldom researched in terms of racism. The article problematizes the assumption that high-skilled migrants experience only minor problems with incorporation. Furthermore, it suggests the importance of racial boundaries in a non-Western society that lacks a colonial background and long-standing relations with migrants. Therefore, our article contributes to a better understanding of how local settings inform the experiences of high-skilled migrants, which are often lost in abstract concepts of global flows and spaces.

5 Highly-Skilled Migrants, Gender, and Well-Being in the Eindhoven Region. An Intersectional Analysis


The shortage of skilled labor and the global competition for highly qualified employees has challenged Dutch companies to develop strategies to attract Highly Skilled Migrants (HSMs). This paper presents a study exploring how well-being is experienced by HSMs living in the Eindhoven region, a critical Dutch Tech Hub. Our population includes highly skilled women and men who moved to Eindhoven for work or to follow their partner trajectory. By analyzing data according to these four groups, we detect significant differences among HSMs. Given the exploratory nature of this work, we use a qualitative method based on semi-structured interviews. Our findings show that gender plays a crucial role in experienced well-being for almost every dimension analyzed. Using an intersectional approach, we challenge previous models of well-being, and we detect different factors that influence the respondents’ well-being when intersecting with gender. Those factors are migratory status, the reason to migrate, parenthood, and origin (EU/non-EU). When all the factors intersect, participants’ well-being decreases in several areas: career, financial satisfaction, subjective well-being, and social relationships. Significant gender differences are also found in migration strategies. Finally, we contribute to debates about skilled migration and well-being by including an intersectional perspective.

6 The challenge of skilled expatriates from the Indian subcontinent losing intellectual capital in Australia: resolving the crisis of habitus

Syed Mohyuddin - Santoshi Sengupta - Parth Patel - Verma Prikshat – Arup Varma
Journal of Intellectual Capital

This article aims to examine the challenges faced by highly skilled expatriates (i.e. professionals and managers) from the Indian subcontinent (i.e. India and neighboring countries) as they attempt to advance their careers in Australia. Extant literature has revealed significant gaps between policies for skilled migration proposed by governments in developed countries and the response to policies by organizations in those countries. By employing the theories of habitus, disembedding, sensemaking and acculturation as frameworks for analysis, the authors explore and explain how these expatriates settle and integrate into their new lives and careers as they resolve their experience of habitus. This study employed phenomenology and narrative research techniques using 21 in-depth, semistructured interviews with expatriate professionals from India, Pakistan, Sri Lanka and Bangladesh to explore and examine their expatriation experiences and their occupational progress in Australia. The findings reveal that on migrating to Australia, expatriate professionals are uprooted from their home country habitus and thrust into new conditions that cause them to lose their cultural, economic, intellectual and social capital, which
further leads them into a state of “disembeddedness.” These highly skilled expatriates then rely on sensemaking and acculturation to resolve their crisis of habitus. The authors also found that gender is a significant factor in this process, as female expatriates faced more career-related barriers compared to their male counterparts. The article brings into focus previously unexamined avenues of expatriation research and proposes a novel theoretical framework that is instrumental in explaining the settlement and integration process of highly skilled professionals from emerging nations.

7 Understanding brain waste: Unequal opportunities for skills development between highly skilled women and men, migrants and nonmigrants
Yvonne Riaño
Popul Space Place. 2021;27:e2456.

Brain waste studies seldom analyse the skills development of tertiary-educated workers according to gender and country of origin. Combining statistical analyses, participatory workshops and 77 qualitative interviews on employment trajectories with highly skilled workers in Switzerland, I offer three contributions. An intersectional perspective reveals unequal opportunities of skills development: Swiss-born men have the highest rates of employment, income and jobs commensurate with their education, followed by foreign-born men, then Swiss-born women and lastly foreign-born women. Second, a multiscalar perspective shows how actions by individuals, families, employers and the state favour or constrain skills advancement among women and men. Individual perceptions of gender roles and unequal childcare responsibilities within couples constrain women's skills development. Further constraints are set by the state and employers' policies and practices regarding migration, childcare, taxation and hiring. Third, a spatial–temporal perspective unveils that gender inequalities arise at particular moments (migration and childbirth) and places (lacking childcare services and limited employment).

8 Skills on the move: Highly skilled migrants in Switzerland and Beyond
Meška Hercog | Flavia Cangià
Popul Space Place. 2021;27:e2457.

This article explores how highly skilled migrants make sense of and subjectively validate their skills when in search of employment in a new country. With the use of a transnational perspective, we suggest that in the context of migration, skills can only be properly understood if we consider the multiple locations and events in people's life trajectories. In addition to foregrounding the spatial context, we also explore skills through a temporal perspective. The country of origin, previous countries of migration, receiving context and future destinations, and past experiences and future plans can all play a role in the way individuals make sense of and subjectively validate what migrants themselves consider to be their skills. Drawing upon qualitative research among highly skilled migrants in Switzerland, we examine how personal and professional skills intertwine with each other when people engage with a given yet evolving socio-economic environment.

Motivation of Seminar and Background:
In recent decades, social analysts have reached broad agreement that migration patterns, regimes, and life-worlds have undergone significant transformations in contemporary Europe. The acceleration of globalization since the 1970s has given rise to many new types of migrants, policies, legal regulations, and societal dynamics, compared to the postwar era, when migration regimes were characterized by temporary labor recruitment policies and, when immigrants settled, the paradigm of assimilation. Free movement logics, security and human rights discourses, and anti-immigrant populist mobilization have all been at work in the recent past, challenging and rearranging existing norms of inclusion and exclusion based on class, country, origin, religion, and gender.
As a result, over the last few years, current trends in researching people's movements have been undergoing a rethinking. More recent studies of mobilities have increasingly superimposed migration studies. When investigating the relationship between mobility and migration studies, scholars must first challenge some of the assumptions that underpin common conceptions of international migration within the context of the international state system. The connection also highlights the question of agency for persons who are or have been on the road.

The distinction between low skilled migration (LSM) and high skilled migration (HSM) is one that can be drawn within the topic of migration. Although there are some fundamental differences between highly skilled and low-skilled individuals migrating, what all migrants have in common is that they bring enormous changes to their adoptive nations. Especially in the case of HSM, there is a net 'brain gain' in adopted countries versus the 'brain drain' from originating countries.

Despite the benefits migrants bring to host countries, studies demonstrate that migrants confront a number of challenges at the country and organizational levels when they migrate. This is true to varying degrees for both sorts of migrants. In many cases, migrants are confronted with discrimination, but according to Hainmueller and Hiscox, HSMs face less prejudice than lower-skilled workers since a workplace with a majority of people with higher education develops tolerance. Additionally, despite Europe's labor market skills deficit, tertiary educated migrants and those with substantial professional experience frequently find themselves in one of two situations: finding a job in their host country is difficult, or they are unable to use their full potential once employed. As a result, highly skilled migrants are more likely than people born in the host nation to be working in jobs that are below their full working capacity. Several explanations have been given for this circumstance, claiming macro-level situational barriers or, more typically, micro-level explanations based on individual attributes such as accessible capital, linguistic disadvantage, or the migrant's profession choice.

Immigration rules of the host countries, among other things, have an important influence in determining employment opportunities. Mandatory salary levels for migrants, as well as limited working permits or quotas and lists of essential skills that are tailored to the needs of the host countries, are common constraints. In the case of HSM, despite efforts to attract them, the highly skilled frequently face non-recognition of their international qualifications and expertise in host countries.

---

nations, thus classifying them as "non-skilled." Furthermore, whereas European migrants have easier access to the European labor market, non-European migrants face more restrictive immigration policies. According to research, migrants encounter prejudice in the recruiting process in addition to these policies. For example, field studies in Germany reveal that job applications with German-sounding names receive a greater response rate than those with Turkish-sounding names. Discrimination in the workplace has been repeatedly reported in the European context as limiting migrants' career opportunities. Other studies demonstrate that, as compared to their non-migrant counterparts, migrants are more likely to be unemployed, earn lower income, work in risky working conditions, or in jobs that are below their educational level. These conditions have a particularly negative impact on migrants from emerging or transitional economies, such as those from Eastern or Southern Europe. These studies show that, while HSMs may have an edge over lower-skilled migrants, they nonetheless encounter barriers to employment in Western Europe because of their migrant status.

Existing research reveals that also in their personal lives, highly competent migrants, regardless of their skills or degree of education, have obstacles linked to foreign language, sociocultural norms, and personal interactions while engaging in "day-to-day banalities of grounded experiences." While employment-related elements are important for these migrants' well-being in the destination country, this is dependent not only on professional reasons but also on non-work-related aspects relating to family, social, and private life. Furthermore, while 'day-to-day banalities' are constantly 'rooted' in specific locations, for migrants, they frequently have a global dimension of personal experiences, social connections, and family commitments.

When it comes to adjusting to the host country, HSMs go through a number of changes. When they first start their careers, HSMs may accept a job that is below their educational or experience level with the intention of using that experience as a stepping stone to a better position. Al Ariss investigates how Lebanese HSMs in France deal with obstacles such as discrimination and legal restrictions. He

---

demonstrates that many HSMs change as they concentrate on earning resources that are highly prized in the host country, such as citizenship or education degrees. By examining skilled migrants in Spain, France, and Canada, Zikic et al.\textsuperscript{30} put a comparable emphasis on the individual level. The authors show that some migrants pursue an adaptive orientation, which is characterized by gaining country-specific knowledge resources and establishing social capital, by analyzing patterns of motivation, identity, and how they cope with problems in the host country.

Numerous disciplines such as management\textsuperscript{31}, geography\textsuperscript{32}, sociology\textsuperscript{33}, and labor economics\textsuperscript{34} have investigated HSMs and their work experiences after migration. Career outcomes, hurdles in the workplace, and individual efforts to advance their careers are all major themes in the lives of HSMs\textsuperscript{35}. Still, more research on high-skilled migrants is needed, and it appears that governments, lawmakers, academics, national and transnational public spheres, as well as migrants and their descendants, lack the instruments to fully comprehend the issue, which is complex and ambiguous. Highly skilled migrants are critical for the knowledge-based economies that are emerging in the context of international labor markets\textsuperscript{36}, therefore a detailed understanding of the factors that contribute to attracting and maintaining them in specific areas is required.

While many HSMs remain in the host countries where they relocated, data suggests that some HSMs return to their homelands. Although most research focus on academics' leave decisions, less is known about the intents and determinants of other HSM groups' return migration\textsuperscript{37}. The majority of research focus on macroeconomic disparities and financial incentives for outmigration and return, specifically income disparities between home and host countries\textsuperscript{38}. Recent data reveal that - independent of economic gains or losses - social networks, filial obligations, and other noninstrumental considerations (e.g., cultural attachments and nostalgia) often impact skilled migrants' decision to return\textsuperscript{39}. Theorists of labor migration frequently characterize skilled migrants' return as a symptom of failure to achieve their professional and financial goals, drawing on neoclassical economics\textsuperscript{40}. Repatriation, on the other hand, is defined as a sensible response to improving market conditions and a high valuation of international credentials and expertise in the homeland, with higher earning potential and advantages for family members as a result\textsuperscript{41}. Although these pragmatic arguments are undoubtedly valid, simply economic thinking prioritizes material advantages and financial mobility while mostly ignoring 'soft' social and psychological elements that are considerably more difficult to quantify\textsuperscript{42}.

\textsuperscript{31} Zikic et al (2010).
\textsuperscript{35} Winterheller J. & Hirt C. (2017).